

BUCHAREST UNIVERSITY OF ECONOMIC STUDIES



Doctoral School of Cybernetics and Statistics Economic

DOCTORAL THESIS

Presented and publicly defended by the author:

ȚICAL (married MATEI) MIHAELA

RETURN MIGRATION OF ROMANIAN MEDICAL PERSONNEL.

A QUANTITATIVE ANALYSIS

Scientific supervisor:

PhD Univ. Prof. Monica Mihaela ROMAN

Doctoral thesis defense committee:

PhD Univ. Prof. Claudiu HERTELIU (Chairperson) – Bucharest
University of Economic Studies

PhD Univ. Prof. Carmen PINTILESCU – AI Cuza University, Iasi

PhD Univ. Prof. Mircea ASANDULUI - AI Cuza University, Iasi

PhD Univ. Prof. Ileana Gabriela NICULESCU-ARON - Bucharest
University of Economic Studies

PhD Univ. Prof. Monica Mihaela ROMAN – Bucharest University of
Economic Studies

Bucharest, September 2024

TABLE OF CONTENT

INTRODUCTION	3
CHAPTER 1. LITERATURE REVIEW: MIGRATION OF DOCTORS - IMPORTANCE AND IMPLICATIONS	13
1.1. Globalization and migration	14
1.2. Medical migration – An introduction	18
1.3. Factors influencing the emigration of doctors	21
1.4. The effects of the emigration of doctors	38
CHAPTER 2. TRENDS AND PATTERNS IN MEDICAL PERSONNEL MIGRATION	49
2.1. Sources of statistical data, data collection and accessibility	49
2.2. Flow and stock of migrant doctors	60
2.3. Flow and stock of migrant doctors from Romania	70
2.4. Cluster analysis applied in the study of the mobility of doctors in the European Union	83
CHAPTER 3. RETURN MIGRATION	98
3.1. Previous studies and theories	99
3.2. Analysis of the intent of return migration of Romanian doctors	108
Methodology	108
Presentation of collected data	116
Results	139
Comparison of logistic regression and ordinal regression results	145
3.3. Conclusions	146
CHAPTER 4. PHYSICIAN MIGRATION AND SALARY	148
4.1. Salary as a determining factor of migration	149
4.2. The impact of increased salary on doctors' migration intent	152
Methodology	156
Results	159
4.3. Conclusions	163
CHAPTER 5. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	164
5.1. Conclusions	164
5.2. Recommendations	169
BIBLIOGRAPHICAL REFERENCES	172
APPENDIX 1	181

Contents of figures

Figure 1 Lee's Theory	22
Figure 2 Main determinants for emigration	35
Figure 3 Brain drain: effects in countries of origin	43
Figure 4 The link between education, the labour market and health services	44
Figure 5 Percentage of doctors trained abroad, 2021 (or nearest year)	61
Figure 6 Countries of destination for doctors by specific countries of training/birth, 2021	62
Figure 7 Stock of doctors in the destination country, selected EU, 2021	65
Figure 8 Migration of doctors in Europe	68
Figure 9 Decisions regarding the recognition of professional qualifications	69
Figure 10 Geography of mobility (establishment)	70
Figure 11 Doctors trained in Romania - Annual flow	79
Figure 12 Doctors trained in Romania - stock	79
Figure 13 Current Professional Certificates (CPC) for the period 2011-2021	81
Figure 14 Decisions taken by the host country for the medical qualification obtained in Romania	82
Figure 15 Dendrogram based on selected features	89
Figure 16 Dendrogram based on socio-demographic, socio-economic and medical system characteristics	90
Figure 17 Dendrogram based on the percentage of doctors trained abroad (immigrants and emigrants), 2017 v. 2021	90
Figure 18 Dendrogram based on all variables, 2021	92
Figure 19 Distribution of respondents by country of residence	117
Figure 20 Distribution of respondents according to the period since they left Romania	118
Figure 21 Distribution of respondents by age and gender	118
Figure 22 Current marital status of respondents	119
Figure 23 Specialized education abroad	120
Figure 24 Profession as a doctor in Romania	120
Figure 25 The current medical specialty	121
Figure 26 Remittances behaviour	122
Figure 27 Reasons why respondents left Romania	123
Figure 28 Reasons why respondents chose their country of residence	125
Figure 29 Initial versus current migration intention	127
Figure 30 Relationship with the host country	128

Figure 31 Mobility intention	129
Figure 32 Mobility intention and occupation	129
Figure 33 Mobility intention, reasons	130
Figure 34 Intention to return to Romania	131
Figure 35 Reasons for returning to Romania	133
Figure 36 Return to Romania - anticipated changes	135
Figure 37 Changes Affecting Return	136
Figure 38 Return to Romania, reasons	137
Figure 39 Average monthly net nominal salary in health and social assistance, in RON	153
Figure 40 Net salary, June compared to February 2018	154
Figure 41 Gross monthly salary for a cardiologist (40 hours/week), EURO	156
Figure 42 The method of difference	157
Figure 43 The flow of emigrant doctors: real Romania versus counterfactual Romania	161

Tables

Table 1 Determinants of migration	22
Table 2 Factors affecting the decision to migrate	24
Table 3 Total doctors and doctors trained abroad, EUROSTAT and OECD data	52
Table 4 Summary of secondary data sources	77
Table 5 ANOVA	95
Table 6 Tukey HSD and Bonferroni test summary	96
Table 7 Typologies of return migration	104
Table 8 Theories of return migration	107
Table 9 Classification. Block 0: Starting Block	139
Table 10 Classification Table a. Block 0: Starting Block	140
Table 11 Variables in equation	140
Table 12 Summary of processed cases	142
Table 13 Parameter estimates	143
Table 14 Gross monthly salary for medical specialists (40 hours/week)	154
Table 15 Flow of foreign-educated doctors from OECD countries, by country of origin	159
Table 16 Flow of Doctors	160

KEYWORDS

migration, emigration, doctor, return migration, salary, cluster analysis, regression

THESIS SUMMARY

The thesis undertakes a comprehensive investigation into the migration of Romanian doctors, with a primary goal of understanding the factors that influence their decision to stay, emigrate or return to Romania. Through a meticulous analysis of these factors, the evolution of migration trends, and the reasons for doctors' return, the research provides a deep understanding of this phenomenon with great implications for Romanian society. The results shed light on the complex issue of medical migration and provide valuable recommendations for public policy and future research.

This thesis described and analysed the evolution of doctor emigration at the global and European levels. The main data sources were international organisations such as OECD, Eurostat, and WHO, supplemented by data from the National Institute of Statistics and the Romanian College of Physicians. The methods used included descriptive analysis to identify historical trends and developments, comparative study to highlight differences and similarities between various countries and regions, and cluster analysis to identify homogeneous groups based on emigration levels, providing a deeper understanding of the geographical distribution and the specific factors that influence the emigration of doctors in different EU countries.

The in-depth study of the intention to return and the causes of migration was based on primary data collected through an online survey in which 614 respondents participated. This primary data, along with the use of advanced statistical methods such as binary and ordinal logistic regression analysis, ensured a rigorous and comprehensive investigation. The analysis identified the key factors influencing the decision to stay abroad permanently. Independent variables such as the years spent abroad, age, sending money to Romania and net monthly income significantly impacted the probability of staying abroad.

Through a counterfactual analysis, the thesis demonstrates the positive effects of active policies to increase wages in the medical sector offering a series of measures to improve the health system in Romania.